

Minutes

May 11, 2015

Special meeting on the Roof Repair Project

Present: Mayor Weaver

Trustees: Richard Phillips

Dale Leiser

Robert Puckett

Brian Murphy

Also attending: Robert Fitzsimmons; Glenn Smith; Renee Shur; Warren Applegate; Rod Blackburn, Dana Spot; Michael Devine; Gary Spielmann; Wendy Spielmann; Randall Dawkins; John Hannan; Bob Albern; Katie Pesano; Chuck Ganson; Liz Martin; Stewart Peckner; Audrey Peckner and Verna Neilson.

Mayor Weaver opened the special meeting on the roof repair project at 4:00 pm.

Mayor Weaver informed the public that this was an informational meeting to discuss the roof bids with the architect and if there was time at the end of the meeting she would open the meeting for public comment otherwise the project would be discussed at the regular village board meeting.

Trustee Puckett informed the public that the board has been working on the roof repair project for several years now. The board had decided to bid the project out for 2nd time to ensure everyone knew what was in the bid and what they were looking to have done. The bid document was laid out in a menu style to allow various options for the board to pick and choose from hoping there may be areas to save money. The menu options were to replace or to recoat the main roof; repair or replace the flat roof, cornice/brackets, cupola and masonry work.

At the village's last board meeting, the village board approved the restoration of the built in gutters, replacing and or repairing of the cornice/ brackets and the replacement of the main roof. This was the base bid and Alternate 1 of the bid specs. The village board awarded low bidder Carey Construction the roof repair project in the amount of \$396,500. Subsequent to that meeting an email was received from Carey Construction that they made an error in submitting their numbers. Carey's bid numbers changed to \$460,000 still being the lowest bidder by approximately \$12,000.

Mayor Weaver feels the bid document for the cornices/brackets is confusing. She is not sure if all brackets were included in the bid document as pricing for Alternate 6, 7 and 8 was listed in the bid document separately. Four

cornice/brackets need to be replaced and 56 are in need of repair. Trustee Murphy had two cornices replicated from a gentleman that did a beautiful job at a cheaper rate. The Mayor is wondering if the village could bid the project out again looking for a more cost effective approach.

Marilyn responded the contractor owes all the corbels noted in the base bid.

Trustee Murphy stated the board has been asking that same question and we have not come up with a knowledgeable individual to come up with those answers. We have not had the resources or means for a much less expensive restoration of this project. The village has received ad hoc answers from contractors that they can do things cheaper but nothing for the restoration project. By having a second round of bids is allowing the board to be responsible with taxpayer's money.

Trustee Puckett wanted to know if the village could still accept the bid from Carey Construction.

Attorney Fitzsimmons noted the bid document did not have a clause for errors even though Carey was still considered the low bidder he felt if the village was to accept Carey's bid it would cause an issue with the other contractors that submitted bids. He noted Carey's one sentence email stated they could not honor their bid and they were pulling out of the project. Attorney Fitzsimmons recommends that the village not accept Carey's revised bid. If, the village board chooses to they could go after the insurance bond. He stated the boards options at this point were to: 1. Rebid 2. Continue with Carey and have a legal discussion 3. Award Mid-State the low bid or 4. Recoat not replace and award Debrino Caulking the bid as low bidder for recoating.

Rob questioned if there was a problem with the bid spec as the village has specked the project twice and only three bids were received. He noted there is almost \$100,000 in difference in the base bid alone. It is concerning to him to see that much difference in the base bid. He asked Marilyn if there was something in the bid that would account for that.

Marilyn stated with the complexity of the project she was happy the village received three bids. This is a Historic project with a prevailing wage rate schedule and that the village is looking for a long lasting roof 20-30 years with built in gutters and masonry work. This is not solely a roof project it has a tremendous amount of carpentry work that is needed.

She feels a contractor could have low balled the base bid to get the project and planned on making his profit on the additional alternatives. Each contractor has their own in house specialty area and will subcontract out the other work needed. This is why she is not surprised by the different bid amounts in each of the alternatives. Materials were changed from the 1st bid to the 2nd bid to reduce the amount of the project. She held a pre bid meeting and she did not have any follow up questions from the contractors.

Mayor Weaver requested if Marilyn has actually looked inside the gutters to see what condition they were in?

Marilyn pulled off pieces from the east and west and saw more deterioration in the front two valleys by the chimney. She noted the bid documents are quantified in case everything was rotted. She has moved to long term coating in the gutters as it is very difficult to get metal in the expansion joints she will use the best elastic system to keep the gutters from leaking.

Attorney Fitzsimmons recommended rebidding the project.

A discussion of why it would cost more for the recoating/ repairing of the roof compared to replacing of the roof was discussed. It was felt it would be harder to repair a roof with damaged areas trying to sure up these areas then it would to remove everything and start new. The longevity of repairing the roof compared to replacing was considered in making the decision on which avenue to take with what alternatives to complete as this time. Time factor of rebidding the project and the availability of the contractors to do the work this year was also considered.

Marilyn reached out to Mid-State and they are interested in the project. The company itself will do the carpentry and roofing themselves.

Mayor Weaver would like their references called and inquire if they are prepared to start the project.

Marilyn will contact their references and confirm with Mid-State that they are prepared to start the project before Wednesday evening's regular village board meeting.

Mayor Weaver inquired if the public had any comment. Liz Martin would like to see the project completed before any further damage could be done.

The meeting was adjourned at 5:53 pm.

Respectfully submitted,

Nicole H. Heeder
Village Clerk